

WWMD?

Completing the Mozart Fragments

James Nicholas

The background: An idyllic few days in Bloomington, Indiana, June 1980, sunny, and not too humid for a change; the setting was the Indiana University Musical Arts Center, and the event was the International Horn Society's Horn Workshop. Celebrated hornists gave guest lectures, recitals, and master classes. Hornists from the world over converged to meet, learn, and exchange ideas and instruments. Instrument manufacturers set up exhibits; publishers displayed printed music. Hans Pizka generated great interest with the exhibition and distribution of his new book *Das Horn bei Mozart (Mozart and the Horn)*, containing a wealth of background information and facsimiles of all extant manuscripts of Mozart's horn works, including the three completed concerti in E-flat, the two movements in D major which are known to us as "No. 1", K. 412 (the Rondò of which is actually an unorchestrated sketch), and several fragments of horn concerti in various states of incompleteness. A recording of reconstructions of some of these by Herman Jeurissen was played in a public presentation, which was attended by the late, venerable Professor Philip Farkas and myself, among others.

Several completions of the Mozart fragments have appeared over the years, notably of the E major Allegro, K. 494a. Some of these have departed freely from Mozart's style with regard to harmonic language, melodic language, and orchestration. At the suggestion of and with the encouragement of Professor Farkas, who knew of my deep involvement with Mozart studies, I embarked upon my own reconstructions and completions, endeavoring to adhere as closely as possible to Mozart's style and structures. These were premiered at a memorable concert in March 1981 at Indiana University with Mark Questad as soloist in K. 370b+371, and Scott Cornelius in K.494a. The concerto in E flat major, K. 370b+371, had its public première in August 1984 at Callaway Gardens in Atlanta with Rebecca Root, principal horn of the Rochester Philharmonic, as soloist; the concert was in honor of former president Jimmy Carter, who was reportedly delighted by the new Mozart horn concerto and Ms. Root's performance. The Allegro in E major, K.494a, was premièred in March 1985 at Lincoln Center with Jerome Ashby, associate principal of the New York Philharmonic, as soloist; both were under the baton of Victoria Bond.

Pangs of Conscience

Although I strove to make these completions sound as Mozartian as possible, with the passage of time I felt that even I had been a little too bold in some aspects, incorporating too great a number of advanced "tricks" that Mozart *might* have used, but not in such concentration. Ultimately, in 1994 I decided that they had to be rewritten in a more conservative, less speculative way,

eliminating my own preferences and “fingerprints” as much as possible. Thus, the development section which I had originally composed for K.370b was completely eliminated (see “The State of the Fragments”, below); that of K.494a was rewritten to be shorter and much simpler. The discovery, in 1990, of 60 bars which had been missing from the Rondeau K.371 necessitated a complete “demolition and rebuilding” of that movement. With a greater understanding of the capabilities and limitations of the natural horn gained from my long association with my good friend Richard Seraphinoff, I also made substantial changes to the solo part of K. 494a.

An unforgettable experience

Upon the acquisition by the Pierpont Morgan Library of the missing pages of the Rondeau, I requested and was granted permission to examine the manuscript in the fall of 1994. I asked if the curator would be kind enough to prepare a microfilm for me, but was told “Oh, just put it on the Xerox machine”. “Really? Are you sure?” “Yes, just go ahead and photocopy it”.

!!!!!

So... onto the photocopier went Mozart’s manuscript.

On the same occasion, I was presented with what has survived of the manuscript of the concerto K.495, and was shown a cozy reading room with an upholstered armchair where I could examine it. The colored inks (red, blue, and green), although still discernible, were somewhat faded after the passage of more than two centuries; but the ink had crystallized in such a way that under the lamp, every page seemed covered with gold glitter. Turning the pages of the Rondo, I marveled that although thousands of musicians and music lovers worldwide knew that tune (including myself at the age of 14), I was face-to-face with the moment of first conception, when **no one** knew that tune – except its author.

The state of the fragments

Allegro in E-flat, K. 370b

Shortly after Mozart moved to Vienna in March of 1781, he sketched a horn concerto in E flat major, possibly for Ignaz Leutgeb but more likely for the Viennese low-horn player Jacob Eisen¹. This is Mozart’s first known attempt to write a concerto for the horn, and the writing for the solo instrument is rather less idiomatic than it is in the Quintet (K. 407) or the “Second” Horn Concerto (K. 417, now known to be the first), both of which date from 1783, two years later.

¹ Eisen was more probably the intended recipient, as Mozart did not feature the rapid scales in the instrument’s higher register which were Leutgeb’s specialty, but did exploit the low range in bars 128-129 and 140 of 370b, as well as writing a low C in the bass clef in the last bar of K.371. In addition, Leutgeb claimed to have had no knowledge of this sketch after Mozart’s death.

The opening Allegro movement is still not widely known, and until recently it had been difficult to gain access to the several fragments which form this almost complete first movement. In 1856, on the occasion of the 100th anniversary of Mozart's birth, his son Carl separated the various sheets on which this movement was sketched, in some cases even cutting them up into halves or quarters, and distributed them to friends and acquaintances. Most of these have survived, but are housed in no fewer than six different collections as widely distributed as Prague and Seattle.² When assembled, they present a typically Mozartian sketch, with the melodic lines (first violin in the tutti, otherwise solo horn) complete throughout, and some sporadic indications of the bass lines and inner parts. There are two gaps of roughly eight bars each in the recapitulation, owing to the removal of half- and quarter-pages; the sketch ends with the soloist's final trill at the end of the recapitulation. Since the final tutti is missing, it is not known whether a pause for a cadenza was intended. Rather unusually, there appears to be no "development" section, though the possibility that one was planned cannot be entirely ruled out. The cadential trill at the end of the solo exposition comprises the final measure on page 8 (measure 71), and the resolution on written G4 appears in the first major of the "following" page, as the full orchestra enters in B flat major with material first appearing in measure 16. However, see the commentary on K.371, below. I have chosen not to insert a development section, as this transition sounds perfectly convincing (unlike what was discovered to be a false one in K.371), and the greatly expanded recapitulation balances the two expositions satisfactorily.

Rondeau, K.371

The sporadically orchestrated Rondeau, K.371, long known to hornists as the Concert Rondo, probably represents the final movement of K.370b, as it is very similar in both handwriting and score format. The version which is known by most hornists was not orchestrated by Mozart; the instrumentation by Bernhard Paumgartner may have been completed for the music publisher Henri Hinrichsen (1868-1942), who owned the manuscript – or most of it – at one time. The sketch had generally been considered to be complete, comprising 219 bars on sixteen pages of score; it was even published in this form in the appendix of the *Neue Mozart-Ausgabe* (1987). However, in 1988 four additional pages (i.e. one "bifolium", a single, very long oblong sheet of paper folded in half) containing sixty bars of music were discovered by Dr. Marie Rolf (now Professor Emerita at the Eastman School of Music), identified as Mozart's work by Alan Tyson, auctioned through Sotheby's by a private collector, and reunited with the rest of the manuscript in the Pierpont Morgan Library in New York. This brings the total number of bars to 279, and in

² Staatsbibliothek, Berlin; Národní muzeum, Prague; Internationale Stiftung Mozarteum, Salzburg; Museum Carolino Augusteum, Salzburg; Bibliothèque nationale, Paris; and a private collection, Seattle.

fact the number “279” is written to the right of the double bar at the end of the movement ³. The restoration of the missing sixty bars reveals a typically Mozartian sonata-rondo structure, in which the first episode modulates to the dominant and is later recapitulated in the tonic. The gap created by the removal of these four pages appears not to have aroused any suspicions in times past; by odd coincidence, there is a somewhat plausible, if not completely convincing, transition between bar 26 (the last bar on page 2 of the manuscript) and bar 87 (the first bar of what was formerly believed to be page 3).

Strangely, although the concerto K.370b+371 was never completed, two of its themes were to achieve immortality in some of Mozart’s most famous works. Bars 5 and 6 of K.370b surfaced again in the very first scene of *Don Giovanni* (K.527, 1787), in which Leporello complains that he is tired of the servant’s life and wishes to play the gentleman. The infectious little motif first heard in measures 7 to 9 of K.371 is developed at great length in Act 2 of *Le Nozze di Figaro* (K.492, 1786), as Susanna is discovered hiding in the closet instead of Cherubino, to the stupefaction of both the Count and the Countess.

Allegro in E major, K.494a

For devotees of Mozart’s horn music, a most tantalizing mystery is the question of who or what induced Mozart to begin a grandly-proportioned horn concerto in the key of E major. This was an unusual key for Mozart to have chosen; his only completed multi-movement work in E major is the Piano Trio K.542 (1788). The concerto was evidently conceived on the same large scale as the later Viennese piano concerti and the Clarinet Concerto, K.622 (1791), to judge from the opening tutti of sixty-five bars; in Mozart’s later concerti, this tutti generally comprises between eighteen and twenty-two percent of the length of the first movement. According to Alan Tyson’s analysis of the type of paper used ⁴, this sketch dates from the summer or autumn of 1785, and in many respects the work calls to mind several familiar piano concerti from the same period. The second theme resembles that of the A major (no. 23, K.488); the pervasive contrapuntal textures call to mind the brilliant compositional display in the opening of the C major (no. 25, K. 503), and the triadic “sunrise” opening as well as the jarring textural and tonal interruptions relate this

³ The first page of this discovery bears a comment at the top in the handwriting of Georg von Nissen, Constanze Mozart’s second husband. It reads “Ich glaube, dieses ist ein Bruchstück eines Horn Concerts” (I believe that this is a fragment of a horn concerto”. Underneath this, in smaller handwriting, we see the response “Allerdings! – A.” (Absolutely! – A.) in the handwriting of Johann Anton André, the first publisher of many of Mozart’s works. Nissen made his customary annotation in the upper right: “Von Mozart und seiner Handschrift” (“By Mozart and in his handwriting”). This is significant as it indicates that the four pages comprising bars 27-86 became separated from the remainder of the manuscript very early on.

⁴ See remark on p. xvi in the foreword to: *Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart: Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke*, (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1987), Serie V, Werkgruppe 14, Band 5: Hornkonzerte.

work to the B-flat major, (no. 27, K.595). This last piano concerto was, admittedly, completed in early 1791, but was sketched some five years earlier, very nearly remaining an unfinished fragment as well owing to the downturn in Mozart's activities as a piano soloist. A peculiar style feature of this E major sketch is the extended passage in tremolando eighth notes (bars 54 and following); Mozart became quite fond of this texture in later works, e.g. the B-flat major Piano Concerto, K.595, *Die Zauberflöte (The Magic Flute)*, K.620, the Clarinet Concerto, K.622, and the unfinished Horn Concerto "No. 1" in D major, K412, now known on the basis of paper studies to be also a product of the year 1791⁵.

The manuscript consists of ninety-one bars, of which the first eighty-one are almost completely orchestrated. As bar 91 coincides with the end of a page (page 8), it is certainly plausible that the sketch of the solo part continued on an additional sheet. However, no further pages were known even by the time Mozart's widow Constanze and the publisher Johann Anton André began sorting and cataloguing Mozart's manuscripts early in the first decade of the nineteenth century. Ignaz Leutgeb, the dedicatee of all three completed horn concerti and of the Horn Quintet, claimed to have had no knowledge of the existence of this piece⁶.

What would Mozart do?

Decisions, decisions. The orchestration of the fragment K.370b was, for the most part, not that challenging. Mozart himself was considerate enough to provide the first violin and bass lines for both the opening tutti and the orchestral passage following the end of the solo exposition, as well as all of the parts in the short contrapuntal passage in bars 21-28. The accompaniment patterns largely suggested themselves through long familiarity with other Mozart concerti and chamber music: Alberti basses or block chords in repeated eighth notes where the solo part was melodic, and some syncopation where greater liveliness and energy seemed desirable, as in passagework containing more rapid notes.

The apparent lack of a development (or *Durchführung*) section was somewhat surprising for the first movement of a concerto; however, Mozart does employ just this sort of "short sonata" or "sonatina" form elsewhere, e.g. in opera overtures. Perhaps he recognized the need to keep a horn concerto relatively small-scale in consideration of the soloist's endurance; a principle he consistently retained with each of the three completed horn concerti in E-flat for Ignaz Leutgeb.

⁵ Alan Tyson, "Mozart's D-major Horn Concerto: Questions of Date and of Authenticity", *Study in Musical Sources and Style: Essays in Honor of Jan LaRue*, ed. Edward H. Roesner and Eugene K. Wolf, (Madison: A-R Editions, 1987).

⁶ *Mozart: Briefe und Aufzeichnungen*, ed. Wilhelm A. Bauer and Otto Erich Deutsch, (Kassel: Internationale Stiftung Mozarteum Salzburg, 1962/63), Vol. IV, p. 358 (no. 1299).

As mentioned above, it was necessary to reconstruct two gaps of roughly eight bars each in the recapitulation which had been created by the removal of some half- and quarter-pages; however, this was not a great challenge, as one of them contained a portion of the second subject which was fully intact in the exposition; the other was fairly easy to reconstruct by analogy with the closing portion of the exposition and the tail end of a short passage in arpeggiated triplets.

The final tutti is missing. I chose to include a pause for a cadenza; this was relatively simple. At the close of the recapitulation, I began with the obvious: the tutti with bars 11-20 of the orchestral introduction (by analogy with the orchestral passage at the close of the solo exposition), then prepared the standard I 6/4 chord. After the trill, I again followed the obvious path, ending with the last six bars of the opening tutti.

The orchestration of the Rondeau, K.371 was in its way both simple and challenging. Dr. Rolf's discovery, in 1990, of 60 additional bars of music necessitated a complete rewriting of my original 1980 version, and a change in conception of the piece in both structure and in the style of accompaniment in the relevant parallel passages. The soloist's opening statement (10 bars) and the following tutti were completely orchestrated by Mozart, so there was no hurdle to clear at the beginning. At bar 26, the newly-discovered 60 bars needed to be inserted (it was quite clear that these four pages were the continuation of the episode which began with the upbeat to bar 25). Mozart's accompaniment for the first 15 bars or so of the first episode is strangely static: long, sustained block chords. At bar 69 and following, the bass line consists of continual triads in slurred quarter notes. I chose to provide a little more interest and motion in the form of some embroidery in sixteenth notes in the first violin part; perhaps a bit elaborate for a work of this genre and period, but the kind of thing one would most definitely find, for example, in *Le Nozze di Figaro*, dating from five years later. In livelier solo passages containing sixteenth notes, the more usual style of accompaniment with repeated eighth notes seemed to be completely fitting and natural.

The completion of the fragment in E major, K.494a was a far greater challenge in almost every aspect. Every Mozart horn concerto is a treasure, but the E major fragment, with its sublime, exalted character, is on yet another level. I constantly strove to maintain that elevated character throughout. The length of the opening tutti (65 bars) implies a first movement of anywhere from 300 to 360 bars, taking Mozart's mature piano concerti and the Clarinet Concerto as models. Mozart provided all of the basic thematic material as well as all of the elements of the later orchestral passages; these were almost completely orchestrated, so in that respect, little speculative work was required.

The solo part modulates to the dominant (B major) rather unusually quickly (in only 15 bars). In order to keep to the implied proportions of the movement, a fairly extensive solo exposition needed to be constructed. Following the examples of the piano concerti K. 467, 482, 595, and the Clarinet Concerto, I composed a brief diversion to a minor key; in this case, a plaintive operatic-style theme in the parallel key of B minor, modulating briefly to its relative major of D,

and then back to B minor, finally to the dominant of B minor via Mozart's favored device of an Italian 6th chord. This allowed for a natural-sounding transition to the second theme in B major. To extend the solo exposition properly in preparing the closing group, I confess that I consciously stole a motif which Mozart had used in two C-major works dating from the same period: the Quartet, K.465 and the piano concerto, K.503. I thought I would disguise it by displacing it so that the bar line occurred one beat later (measures 122 and 123 in my completion). To my great embarrassment, I realized years later that the same motif, in exactly the form in which I had displaced it, occurs in the first movement of the Horn Quintet, K. 407; a work which I had played several times, but many years ago. This was my only intentional theft; at least we can say that those two or three bars are absolutely authentic Mozart!

“A good composer borrows – but a great composer steals!” (*attributed to Igor Stravinskiy*)

After the cadential trill, following Mozart's standard practice, I used the latter portion of the opening tutti (bars 44ff, beginning with the triumphant contrapuntal display), and of course transposed to the dominant key of B major. I opted for a longer rather than a shorter version of this orchestral passage in order to give the horn soloist a few seconds more to rest, and also to maintain the implied large-scale proportions of the movement. The “development”, or more properly *Durchführung*, is rather operatic (in the piano concerti K. 503 and 595, as well as in the Third Horn Concerto K.447, Mozart really does develop themes and motifs, but this is not the norm in the first movements of his concerti). I began by composing a sort of “Countess aria” of eight bars; the first four bars undergo a brief series of modulations, followed by an episode in which brusque orchestral interruptions in the signature tremolando eighth notes are interrupted by the horn's pleas for calm (See K. 595 and K.622 for similar passages). The darkness of E minor eventually clears, subsides, and shifts to E major; a brief preparation in the dominant and a short chromatic scale leads to the recapitulation.

In order to give the hornist some additional respite, I inserted a chunk of the opening tutti (bars 16-23) after the soloist's initial restatement of the opening theme, a procedure Mozart employed in the piano concerti K. 482 and 488, as well as in the “Fourth” horn concerto K.495 (now known to be the second). The minor key episode follows, and this time the second subject is preceded by the exquisite transition which appeared in the opening tutti (bars 24-32); again, see K.482 for a precedent. The remainder of the recapitulation parallels the exposition closely. After the cadential trill, the orchestra again enters with the contrapuntal passage from the opening tutti (bars 44ff); I composed a very brief motivic preparation for the I 6/4 chord and pause for a cadenza, and this is followed by the final tutti in tremolando eighth notes. As this movement would be inevitably performed as a stand-alone piece, I added a little flourish at the end (à la K. 447, 482, and 495) to give it a little stronger feeling of finality.

It goes without saying that no one can be Mozart, and it is a humbling experience to try, through considerable thought, decision-making, and labor, to even attempt to imitate what came naturally to him. However, it is my hope that these completions are as close in style as possible to what he

might have done, and that they might bring enjoyment to hornists by making what *is* authentic accessible for performance.

A note about the correct chronology and dating of the four horn concerti commonly performed today:

On the basis of paper studies, our understanding of the dates of composition has changed in the cases of K.412 and K.447. The “Second” concerto, K.417 (1783), is the first which Mozart completed. The “Fourth”, K.495 (1786) is the second. The Third, K.447, is in fact the third. The only reason it was assigned a relatively low Köchel number is that Mozart had failed to enter it in the catalogue of his works which he began to compile in 1784. Handwriting and paper analysis linking it to *Don Giovanni*, K.527, suggest that its date of composition is 1787 or possibly later; its proper Köchel listing should therefore be in the 500 range. Georges de Saint-Foix, in *Les Concertos pour le cor de Mozart* (1929)⁷, had already come to the conclusion that the concerto could not have been written prior to 1788 or 1789, owing to the internal evidence (the dramatic content and extremely sophisticated, daring modulations in the development section of the first movement, as well as the unusual orchestration featuring clarinets and bassoons instead of the usual oboes and horns). The concerto which has been traditionally known as the “First”, K.412, is actually the fourth – or would have been, if Mozart had lived to orchestrate the Rondo and compose a central movement for it. The sketch for the Rondo, and probably the complete first movement, date from March 1791 or later; the Köchel number of the completed work would therefore have fallen in the 600 range. The Rondò commonly performed today was composed by Mozart’s student Franz Süssmayr in 1792 and makes use only of Mozart’s Rondò theme; the episodes are of Süssmayr’s own invention.

Scores, orchestral parts, and horn & piano sets of the completed Mozart fragments K. 370b+371 and K.494a are available through Birdalone Music: www.birdalone.com

James Nicholas (b. 1957) received his doctorate and two master's degrees in music from Indiana University, where his cello instructors were Éva Czakó-Janzer, János Starker, and Helga Winold, and where he also pursued the study of the languages, cultures, and history of Central and Eastern Europe. He is particularly interested in historical performance styles, and has collaborated with many of the foremost authorities in early music performance today. A composer and editor, he has published several original works for the natural horn as well as articles on historic performance styles, scholarly editions of Baroque and Early Classical music

⁷ Georges de Saint-Foix, “Les Concertos pour le cor de Mozart”, in: *Revue de Musicologie* 10 (Paris, November 1929), p. 243.

for strings, and reconstructions of two unfinished Mozart horn concerti. A translator of French, German, Czech, Slovak, and Hungarian, he combined his musical and linguistic experience in coaching the Cleveland Orchestra Chorus in Old Church Slavonic for its millennium performance of Leoš Janáček's Glagolitic Mass. Recently, he has created the first English-language setting of the traditional music of the Divine Liturgy of the Armenian Apostolic Church.

Jim earned his state Firefighter I and II certifications at the Connecticut Fire Academy, and has been a member of the Rocky Hill, Connecticut, Fire Department since 2004.